Jennifer Larabee, CA Bar No. 163989 Kenneth H. Abbe, CA Bar No. 172416 1 Federal Trade Commission 2 10877 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 700 Los Angeles, CA 90024 3 FILED CLERK, U.S. DISTRICT COURT (310) 824-4343 (ph.) (310) 824-4380 (fax) 4 DEC 2 2 2004 5 ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION 6 CENTRAL OISTON CALIFURNIA DEPUTY 7 8 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA** 9 WESTERN DIVISION 10 FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, 11 CIVIL NO. 02-6468 ABC(Ex) Plaintiff, 12 **STIPULATION AND** 13 Proposed FINAL ORDER OF JUBILEE FINANCIAL SERVICES, PERMANENT INJUNCTION 14 INC., et al AS TO DEFENDANT **Defendants** JOHN MITCHELL 15 16

Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission ("FTC" or "Commission"), pursuant to 17 Section 13(b) of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. § 18 53(b), filed a complaint against Defendants JUBILEE FINANCIAL SERVICES, 19 INC. ("Jubilee"), JOHN E. GUSTAVSEN ("Gustavsen"), JABEZ FINANCIAL 20GROUP, INC. ("Jabez"), and CURTIS COBB ("Cobb") for an injunction and 21 other equitable relief and an *ex parte* application for a Temporary Restraining Order 22 ("TRO") with Asset Freeze, Appointment of a Temporary Receiver, Expedited 23 Discovery, and Order to Show Cause Why a Preliminary Injunction Should Not 24 Issue. A First Amended Complaint was filed which added a fourth count and added 25 GUSTAVSEN LEARNING CENTERS, INC. ("GLC"), JEMUEL APELAR 26a.k.a. JIM APELAR ("Apelar"), DEBT RELIEF COUNSELORS OF 27 AMERICA, P.C. ("DRCOA"), and JOHN K. MITCHELL ("Mitchell") as 28

1 2

3

4

5

6

7

defendants in this action.

Now Plaintiff Commission and Defendant Mitchell, negotiating through their counsel, have agreed to a settlement of this action. Accordingly, the Commission and Defendant Mitchell consent to entry of this Stipulated Final Judgment and Order ("Order") without trial or adjudication of any issue of law or fact herein.

# **FINDINGS OF FACT**

Defendant Mitchell was properly served with the First Amended
 Complaint and Summons in this matter.

10 2. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of the case and
11 personal jurisdiction over Defendant Mitchell. Venue in the Central District of
12 California is proper.

13 3. The alleged actions of Defendant Mitchell are in or affecting
14 commerce, as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.

4. The Complaint states a claim upon which relief can be granted against
the Defendants under Sections 5(a) and 13 (b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S. C. § 45(a)
and 53(b).

18 5. Plaintiff has the authority under Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15
19 U.S.C. § 53(b), to seek the relief it has requested.

20 6. Defendant Mitchell has not admitted to liability as to the charges in the
21 Complaint, and his consent to entry of this permanent injunction shall not be
22 interpreted to constitute an admission by him that he has engaged in any violations
23 of any law or regulations.

7. Defendant Mitchell waives all rights to seek judicial review or
otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order. Defendant Mitchell also
waives any claim that he may hold under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C.
§ 2412 (as amended), concerning the prosecution of this action to the date of this
Order. Defendant Mitchell shall bear his own costs and attorneys' fees.

8. This Order is remedial in nature and shall not be construed as the payment of a fine, penalty, punitive assessment, or forfeiture.

9. Defendant Mitchell enters into this Order freely and without coercion, and acknowledges that he understands the provisions of this Order and is prepared to abide by its terms.

10. Entry of this Order is in the public interest.

# ORDER

9 For purposes of this Final Judgment and Order for Permanent Injunction, the 10 following definitions shall apply:

# Definitions

1. "Document" is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope to the
 usage of the term in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 34(a), and includes writings,
 drawings, graphs, charts, photographs, audio and video recordings, computer
 records, and other data compilations from which information can be obtained and
 translated, if necessary, through detection devices into reasonably usable form. A
 draft or non-identical copy is a separate document within the meaning of the term
 "document."

The terms "and" and "or" shall be construed conjunctively or
 disjunctively as necessary, and to make the applicable phrase or sentence inclusive
 rather than exclusive.

3. "<u>Corporate Defendants</u>" means Jubilee Financial Services, Inc.,
 Jabez Financial Group, Inc., Gustavsen Learning Centers, Inc. and Debt Relief
 Counselors of America, P.C., collectively.

4. "<u>Consumer</u>" means any person, including any individual, group,
unincorporated association, limited or general partnership, corporation or other
business entity.

5. "Debtor" means any consumer indebted to a creditor or creditors.

28

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

11

6. "Debt negotiation" means

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

- a. the business or practice of receiving, in return for consideration, the scheduled receipt of a debtor's monies, or evidences thereof, for the purpose of distribution among certain specified creditors in payment, or partial payment, of the debtor's obligations; or
- b. the business or practice of acting or offering or attempting to act as an intermediary between a debtor and his creditors for the purpose of settling, negotiating, or in any way altering the terms of payment of any debt of a debtor.

7. "<u>Assisting others</u>" means knowingly providing any of the following goods or services to another person or entity:

- a. performing customer service functions, including, but not limited to, receiving or responding to consumer complaints; or
- b. formulating or providing, or arranging for the formulation or provision
   of, any telephone sales script or any other marketing material; or
- c. providing names of, or assisting in the generation of, potential customers; or

d. performing marketing services of any kind.

#### I.

#### PERMANENT BAN

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that Defendant Mitchell, whether acting directly or through any corporation, limited liability company, subsidiary, division or other device, is hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from engaging in debt negotiation, or receiving any remuneration of any kind whatsoever from, or holding a majority ownership interest, share, or stock in, or serving as an officer, director, trustee, or general manager of, any business entity engaged in whole or in part in the advertising, marketing, promoting, offering for sale, or sale of, debt negotiation services. For purposes of this provision only, a creditor does not include a person, or entity, with whom a consumer, or debtor, has a bona fide dispute.

## Π.

#### **PROHIBITED MISREPRESENTATIONS**

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Mitchell and his assignees, 7 8 agents, attorneys, servants, employees and all persons or entities directly or 9 indirectly under his control, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service 10 or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, 11 division or other device, in connection with the advertising, marketing, promoting, 12 offering for sale, or sale of any good or service, are hereby restrained and enjoined 13 from misrepresenting, or assisting others in misrepresenting, expressly or by 14 implication, orally or in writing, any fact material to a consumer's decision to buy 15 or accept the good or service, including but not limited to the ability to reduce the 16 amount owed by a debtor to the creditor or their ability to have a positive effect on 17 the debtor's credit report. 18

#### Ш.

#### SUSPENDED JUDGMENT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that judgment is hereby entered against
Defendant Mitchell in the amount of \$2,628,535.00 (two million six hundred
twenty-eight thousand five hundred thirty-five dollars), *provided*, however, that all
of this amount shall be suspended subject to the conditions set forth in Paragraph
IV. of this Order.

- 27 || / /
- 28 //

19

20

21

1

2

3

4

5

6

# **RIGHT TO REOPEN AND TERMINATE SUSPENSION**

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Commission's agreement to, and the 3 Court's approval of, this Order is expressly premised upon the truthfulness, 4 accuracy, and completeness of the sworn financial statements provided by 5 Defendant Mitchell to counsel for the Commission on or about November 5, 2003, 6 and the sworn testimony given by Defendant Mitchell on March 11, 2003, which 7 contain material information relied upon by the Commission in negotiating and 8 agreeing to the terms of this Order. If, upon motion by the Commission to the 9 Court, the Court finds that Defendant Mitchell failed to disclose any asset with a 10 value exceeding \$1,000, or materially misrepresented the value of any asset, or 11 made any other material misrepresentation in or omission from the above-12 referenced financial statements and information, the suspension of the monetary 13 judgment will be terminated and the entire judgment amount of\$2,628,535.00 (two 14 million six hundred twenty-eight thousand five hundred thirty-five dollars) will be 15 immediately due and payable. Should this judgment be modified as to the monetary 16 liability of Defendant Mitchell, this Order, in all other respects, shall remain in full 17 force. Any proceedings instituted under this Paragraph shall be in addition to, and 18 not in lieu of, any other proceedings the Commission may initiate to enforce this 19 Order. Solely for the purposes of reopening this judgment or enforcing this 20Paragraph, Defendant Mitchell waives any right to contest any of the allegations set 21 forth in the Complaint filed in this matter or the monetary judgment referenced 22 23 above.

#### V.

#### **CONSUMER REDRESS**

# IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

A. All funds paid pursuant to this Order shall be deposited into a fund

24

25

26

27

28

1

administered by the Commission or its agent to be used for equitable relief, including but not limited to consumer redress and any attendant expenses for the administration of any redress fund. In the event that direct redress to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable or funds remain after redress is completed, the Commission may apply any remaining funds for such other equitable relief (including consumer information remedies) as it determines to be reasonably related to the practices alleged in the Complaint. Any funds not used for such equitable relief shall be deposited to the Treasury as disgorgement. Defendant Mitchell shall have no right to challenge the Commission's choice of remedies under this paragraph.

# B. The Commission and the Receiver shall have full and sole discretion to:

- Determine the criteria for participation by individual claimants in any consumer redress program implemented pursuant to this Order;
- 2. Determine the manner and timing of any notices to be given to consumers regarding the existence and terms of such programs; and
- 3. Delegate any and all tasks connected with such redress program to any individual, partnerships, or corporations; and pay reasonable fees, salaries, and expenses incurred thereby from the payments made pursuant to this Order;
- C. Defendant Mitchell expressly waives his right to litigate the issue of disgorgement. Defendant Mitchell acknowledges and agrees that all money paid pursuant to this Order is irrevocably paid to the Commission for purposes of settlement between Plaintiff and Defendant Mitchell; and

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

D. No portion of this payment shall be deemed a fine, penalty, punitive assessment, or forfeiture.

#### VI.

#### **CUSTOMER LISTS**

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Mitchell, and his assigns, 6 agents, servants, attorneys, employees, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, are permanently restrained and enjoined from selling, renting, leasing, transferring, or otherwise disclosing the name, address, telephone number, credit card number, bank account number, e-mail address, or other identifying information of any person who paid any money to the Corporate Defendants at any time; provided that such identifying information may be disclosed to a law enforcement agency or as required by any law, regulation, or court order. 16

#### VII.

# **CEASE COLLECTIONS NOTICES TO CONSUMERS**

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Mitchell, and his assigns, agents, servants, employees, attorneys, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device engaged in debt negotiation services, shall:

Cease all collection efforts on accounts arising from contracts, A. agreements, or understandings between the Corporate Defendants and consumers, including but not limited to directing all third parties engaged in collection efforts regarding such accounts to cease all such

1

2

3

4

5

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

.27

28

collection activities and to cease furnishing any negative information to any consumer credit reporting agencies;

- B. Within twenty (20) days after the date this Order is entered, return to consumers all uncashed checks or other negotiable instruments, if any, in Defendant Mitchell's possession that have been received, directly or indirectly, on accounts arising from contracts, agreements, or understandings between the Corporate Defendants and consumers, including with each such returned check or other negotiable instrument a notice to the consumer stating that, as a result of an agreement between Defendant Mitchell and the Federal Trade Commission settling allegations regarding Defendant Mitchell's offer for sale and sale of debt negotiation services, those consumers' contracts are rescinded; and
- C. Within sixty (60) days after the date this Order is entered, provide the names and addresses of those consumers to whom checks or other negotiable instruments were returned pursuant to Subsection B above to: Assistant Regional Director, WR-LA, Federal Trade Commission, 10877 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 700, Los Angeles, California 90024.

#### VIII.

# ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF ORDER BY DEFENDANT MITCHELL

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Mitchell, within five (5) business days of receipt of this Order as entered by the Court, must submit to the Commission a truthful sworn statement acknowledging receipt of this Order.

Settle.Perm.Mitchell

#### IX.

#### DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER BY DEFENDANT MITCHELL

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of five (5) years from the date of entry of this Order, Defendant Mitchell shall deliver a copy of this Order to the principals, officers, directors, managers and employees under Defendant Mitchell's control for any business that (a) employs or contracts for personal services from Defendant Mitchell and (b) has responsibilities with respect to the subject matter of this Order. Defendant Mitchell shall secure from each such person a signed and dated statement acknowledging receipt of the Order within thirty (30) days after the date of service of the Order or the commencement of the employment relationship.

# X.

#### **RECORD KEEPING PROVISIONS**

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that, for a period of eight (8) years from the date of entry of this Order, in connection with any business where Defendant Mitchell is the majority owner of the business or directly or indirectly controls the business, Defendant Mitchell and his agents, attorneys, employees, and assigns, and those persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, are hereby restrained and enjoined from failing to create and the following records:

- A. Accounting records that reflect the cost of goods or services sold, revenues generated, and the disbursement of such revenues;
- B. Personnel records accurately reflecting: the name, address, and telephone number of each person employed in any capacity by such business, including as an independent contractor; that person's job title

or position; the date upon which the person commenced work; and the date and reason for the person's termination, if applicable;

- C. Customer files containing the names, addresses, phone numbers, dollar amounts paid, quantity of items or services purchased, to the extent such information is obtained in the ordinary course of business;
- D. Complaint and refund requests (whether received directly, indirectly or through any third party) and any responses to those complaints or requests; and
- E. Copies of all sales scripts, training materials, advertisements, or other marketing materials.

# XI.

#### **COMPLIANCE MONITORING**

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that, for the purpose of monitoring and investigating compliance with any provision of this Order,

- A. Within ten (10) days of receipt of written notice from a representative of the Commission, Defendant Mitchell shall submit additional written reports, sworn to under penalty of perjury; produce documents for inspection and copying; appear for deposition; and/or provide entry during normal business hours to any business location in Defendant Mitchell's possession or direct or indirect control to inspect the business operations;
- B. In addition, the Commission is authorized to monitor compliance with this Order by all other lawful means, including but not limited to the following:

- obtaining discovery from any person, without further leave of court, using the procedures prescribed by Fed. R. Civ. P. 30, 31, 33, 34, 36, and 45;
- 2. posing as consumers and suppliers to: Defendant Mitchell's employees, or any other entity managed or controlled in whole or in part by Defendant Mitchell, without the necessity of identification or prior notice;

**Provided** that nothing in this Order shall limit the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1, to obtain any documentary material, tangible things, testimony, or information relevant to unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce (within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 45(a)(1)).

 C. Defendant Mitchell shall permit representatives of the Commission to interview any employer, consultant, independent contractor, representative, agent, or employee who has agreed to such an interview, relating in any way to any conduct subject to this Order. The person interviewed may have counsel present.

#### XII.

# **COMPLIANCE REPORTING BY DEFENDANT MITCHELL**

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that, in order that compliance with the provisions of this Order may be monitored:

A. For a period of five (5) years from the date of entry of this Order,

Defendant Mitchell shall notify the Commission of the following:

- a. Any changes in his residence, mailing addresses, and telephone numbers, within ten (10) days of the date of such change;
- b. Any changes in his employment status (including self-employment) within ten (10) days of the date of such change. Such notice shall include the name and address of each business that Defendant Mitchell is affiliated with, employed by, or performs services for; a statement of the nature of the business; and a statement of his duties and responsibilities in connection with the business;
- c. Any changes in his name or use of any aliases or fictitious names; and
- 2. Defendant Mitchell shall notify the Commission of any changes in corporate structure that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order, including but not limited to a dissolution, assignment, sale, merger, or other action that would result in the emergence of a successor corporation; the creation or dissolution of a subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order; the filing of a bankruptcy petition; or a change in the corporate name or address, at least thirty (30) days prior to such change, *provided* that, with respect to any proposed change in the corporation about which Defendant Mitchell learns less than thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, he shall notify the Commission as soon as is practicable after obtaining such knowledge.

B. One hundred eighty (180) days after the date of entry of this Order,

Defendant Mitchell shall provide a written report to the FTC, sworn to under penalty of perjury, setting forth in detail the manner and form in which he has complied and are complying with this Order. This report shall include, but not be limited to:

- Any changes required to be reported pursuant to subparagraph
   (A) above;
- A copy of each acknowledgment of receipt of this Order obtained by Defendant Mitchell pursuant to Paragraph IX;
- C. For the purposes of this Order, Defendant Mitchell shall, unless otherwise directed by the Commission's authorized representatives, mail all written notifications to the Commission to:

Assistant Regional Director, Western Region, Los Angeles Federal Trade Commission 10877 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 700 Los Angeles, California 90024

Re: <u>FTC v. JUBILEE FINANCIAL SERVICES, INC. ET AL</u>, CV NO. 02-6468 ABC (Ex)

 D. For purposes of the compliance reporting required by this Paragraph, the Commission is authorized to communicate directly with Defendant Mitchell.

# XIII.

# **INDEPENDENCE OF OBLIGATIONS**

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that the expiration of any requirements imposed by this Order shall not affect any other obligation under this Order.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

# XIV.

#### **COSTS AND ATTORNEYS' FEES**

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that each party to this Order bear its own costs and attorneys' fees incurred in connection with this action.

#### XV.

#### **RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for purposes of construction, modification and enforcement of this Order.

#### XVI.

#### WAIVER OF CLAIMS

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that Defendant Mitchell waives all claims under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, *as amended by* Pub. L. 104-121, 110 Stat. 847, 863-64 (1996), and all rights to seek appellate review or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order, or the temporary or preliminary orders entered in this proceeding, and further waives and releases any claim he may have against the FTC, its employees, agents or representatives.

IT IS SO ORDERED

Dated Dec, 22, 2004 AUDREY COLLINS

United States District Judge

| |

/ /

1	XVII.
2	ENTRY BY CLERK
3	
4	There being no just reason for delay, the Clerk of the Court is hereby directed
5	to enter this Order.
6	SO STIPULATED:
7	Dated: December 20, 2004 FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
8	1 Demarka
9	Jennifer Larabee, Esq. Kenneth H. Abbe, Esq.
10	Attorneys for Plaintiff
11	
12	Dated:, 2004 John K. Mitchell, Defendant
13	John K. Witchen, Detendant
14	
15 16	APPROVED AS TO FORM
17	
18	Dated:, 2004
19	Paul Carter, Esq. Attorney for Defendant Mitchell
20	
21	
22	IT IS SO ORDERED.
23	
24	Dated:
25	United States District Judge
26	
27	
28	
	Settle.Perm.Mitchell 16

(

דו לממל מליסורוו בס

nec.



CC24C6479C:

'NN YH-

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Kenneth H. Abbe, certify as follows:

I am over the age of 18 and am employed by the Federal Trade Commission. My business address is 10877 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 700, Los Angeles, California 90024. On December 2/, 2004, I caused the attached "STIPULATION AND [Proposed] FINAL ORDER OF PERMANENT INJUNCTION AS TO DEFENDANT JOHN MITCHELL" to be served by pre-paid, first class U.S. mail to the following:

Paul J. Carter, Esq. Bergkvist, Bergkvist & Carter 400 Oceangate, Suite 800 Long Beach, California 90802

Susan I. Montgomery, Esq. 5108 Wilderness Lane Culver City, CA 90230

Robert K. Scott, Esq. R.K. Scott & Associates 2000 E. 4th St. #320 Santa Ana, CA 92705

Adrian B. Stern, CPA Clumeck, Stern 17404 Ventura Blvd., 2nd Floor Encino, CA 91316

COUNSEL FOR DEFENDANT JOHN K. MITCHELL

COUNSEL FOR PERMANENT RECEIVER

COUNSEL FOR DEFENDANT JEMUEL APELAR

PERMANENT RECEIVER FOR DEFENDANTS JUBILEE FINANCIAL SERVICES, JABEZ FINANCIAL GROUP AND GLC

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Dated: December  $\frac{2}{2}$ , 2004

enneth M. Abbe